

## The F-ai-rest of them all.

# **How To Do Healthy Machine** Learning in Health.

Dr. Marzyeh Ghassemi MIT IMES/EECS.CSAIL CIFAR AI Chair, Azrieli Global Scholar



healthy?



healthy?







• We collect **data** on those who are **sick**.



• We predict when **bad events** or **outcomes**, e.g., worsening sickness, happens.





#### SOTA Methods At/Above Human Performance



imes

Figure: Debbie Maizels / Springer Nature



#### ML Researchers Have Really Engaged

								SAIL Conf	ference
								ACM	I CHIL
								WWW/\	Neb of Health
								KDD/Heal	th Day
							AAAI/H	lealth Intell	igence
					I	Machine Lea	rning for H	ealthcare (N	MLHC)
					Stanford's	Big Data in F	Precision H	lealth Confe	erence
	NeurIPS	/Clinical Da Genor	ata & mics					NeurIPS	/ML4H
2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021



**EECS** 

#### Models Are Regulated Advice-Givers

#### FDA Cleared AI Algorithms

Our list of FDA cleared AI algorithms provides valuable details on each model, bringing all of the relevant information together for easy access. Convenient summaries for each algorithm include model manufacturer, FDA product code, body are predicate devices, product testing and evaluation related to product performance, and clinical validation. Our Define-AI use cases match many of the models and those are listed under Related Use Cases. For other details, clicking on the mode directly to the FDA summary.

Check back regularly to see which new algorithms are available and have been added to the list. Send information on AI algorithms that are not listed and report missing information to DSI@acr.org.

Search Q	Company v	Subspeciality	Body Area	Modality	Date Cleared
Product 🌲	Company 🌲	Subspeciality 🌲	Body Area 🍦	Modality 🌲	Date Cleared 🍦
Transpara 1.7.0	ScreenPoint Medical B.V.	Women's Imaging	Breast	МАМ	06/02/2021
CINA CHEST	AVICENNA.AI	Chest Imaging	Pulmonary Arteries	СТ	05/19/2021
Overjet Dental Assist	Overjet, Inc.	Dental Imaging	Teeth	XRAY	05/19/2021
MEDO- Thyroid	Medo.AI	Chest Imaging	Thyroid	US	04/23/2021
Saige-Q	DeepHealth	Women's Imaging	Breast	MAM	04/16/2021
syngo.CT Lung CAD (VD20)	Siemens Healthineers	Chest Imaging	Lung	СТ	03/31/2021
Viz ICH	Viz. ai, inc.	Neuroradiology	Brain	СТ	03/23/2021
Vbrain	Vysioneer Inc.	Neuroradiology	Brain	MR	03/19/2021
Imbio RV/LV Software	Imbio LLC	Cardiac Imaging	Heart	СТ	03/09/2021
Optellum Virtual Nodule Clinic, Optellum Software, Optellum Platform	Optellum Ltd.	Chest Imaging	Lung	ст	03/05/2021
NinesMeasure	Nines, Inc.	Chest Imaging	Chest	СТ	02/25/2021
Veolity	MeVis Medical Solutions AG	Chest Imaging	Chest	СТ	02/23/2021
Lvivo Software Application	DiA Imaging Analysis Ltd	Cardiac Imaging,Abdominal Imaging	Heart,Head	US	02/05/2021
qp-Prostate	Quibim	Abdominal Imaging	Prostate	MR	02/04/2021
Visage Breast Density	Visage Imaging GmbH	Women's Imaging	Breast	MAM	01/29/2021
uAl EasyTriage-Rib	Shanghai United Imaging Intelligence Co., Ltd.	Chest Imaging	Chest	СТ	01/15/2021
HearFlow Analysis	HeartFlow, Inc.	Cardiac Imaging	Coronary Arteries	СТ	01/08/2021
BrainInsight	Hyperfine Research, Inc.	Neuroradiology	Brain	MR	01/07/2021

Source: https://models.acrdsi.org/ August 31, 2021







• We collect **data** on those who are **sick**.



• We predict when **bad events** or **outcomes**, e.g., worsening sickness, happens.



• Bad events in sick people is actually **anomaly detection** in **anomalous data**.







• We collect **data** on those who are **sick**.



• We predict when **bad events** or **outcomes**, e.g., worsening sickness, happens.



• Bad events in sick people is actually **anomaly detection** in **anomalous data**.



• We have no idea what it means for a **diverse population** to be **healthy**.







• We collect **data** on those who are **sick**.



• We predict when **bad events** or **outcomes**, e.g., worsening sickness, happens.



• Bad events in sick people is actually **anomaly detection** in **anomalous data**.



• We have no idea what it means for a **diverse population** to be **healthy**.

What exactly are we learning?





#### Healthy Machine Learning in Health



#### Creating actionable insights in human health.





#### Healthy Machine Learning in Health



#### Creating actionable insights in human health.





#### **Privacy in Clinical Prediction Models**

Anonymization is not robust to linkage.

Record	505025220				
Hospital	162: Sacred Heart				
	Medical Center in				
	Providence				
Admit Type	1: Emergency				
Type of Stay	LT LODATIONT				
Length of Stay	6 days				
Discharge Date	Oct-2011				
Discharge	Co Danie (Trafan ioniana				
Status	under the care of an				
	health service				
	organization				
Charges	\$71708.47				
Payers	1: Medicare				
	6: Commercial insurance				
	625: Other government				
	sponsoreu patients				
Emergency	E8162: motor vehicle				
Codes	traffic accident due t				
	loss of control; loss				
	control mv-mocycl				
Diagnosis	80843: closed iracture				
Codes	of other specified part				
	of pelvis				
	51851: pulronary				
	insufficiency following				
	trauma & surgery				
	276/ hyposmolality				
	& or hyponatremia				
	78057: tachycardia				
	2851: acute				
	porrhagic anemia				
Age in Years	60				
Age in Months	725				
Gender	Male				
ZIP	98851				
State Reside	WA				
Race, Benniercy	Non-Hispanic				
-					

MAN 60 THROWN FROM MOTORCYCLE A 60-year-old Soap Lake man was hospitalized Saturday afternoon after he was thrown from his motorcycle. Ronald Jameson was riding his 2003 Harley-Davidson north on Highway 25, when he failed to negotiate a curve to the left. His motorcycle became airborne before landing in a wooded area. Jameson was thrown from the bike; he was wearing a helmet during the 12:24 p.m. incident. He was taken to Sacred Heart Hospital. The police cited speed as the cause of the crash. [News Review 10/18/2011]





#### Why Differential Privacy?

• In healthcare settings, it is crucial that we provide the same level of privacy protection for all individuals.



Sumana is in dataset A: gender, race, age, and zip code.



These properties alone make her identifiable to an adversary who can access the data, or the outputs of a model trained on the data.



Differential privacy protects those with combination of attributes that are uniquely identifiable.





### Differential Privacy in Yearly Mortality Prediction

• Evaluate year-to-year performance with privacy guarantee  $e^{-\Sigma}$ 

 $\mathcal{L}(\theta(x), y)$ Medium Privacy No Privacy Prediction True Label Task Low Privacy High Privacy Mortality 0 1 Dataset Shift AUROC  $g = \nabla_{\theta} \mathcal{L}(\theta(x), y)$ 2002 ... 2007 2008 2009 ... 2012 -1.13 0.06 History of Data Trained On +  $\mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2 \cdot C^2)$ -0.56 1.10 Update Model  $max\left(1, \frac{||\nabla_{\theta}g||}{C}\right)$ 

 $\Pr[\mathcal{M}(x) \in \mathcal{S}] \le \exp(\varepsilon) \Pr[\mathcal{M}(y) \in \mathcal{S}] + \delta,$ 

[1] Suriyakumar, Papernot, Goldenberg, Ghassemi. "Chasing Your Long Tails: Differentially Private Prediction in Health Care Settings." In Proceedings of the 2021 ACM Conference on Fairness, Accountability, and Transparency (FAccT '21).

IME



#### Differential Privacy vs. Utility Trade-off

• What price are we willing to pay for differential privacy?



Large loss of performance for Less severe drops in tasks high privacy models in mortality. with lower initial performance.

[1] Suriyakumar, Papernot, Goldenberg, Ghassemi. "Chasing Your Long Tails: Differentially Private Prediction in Health Care Settings." In *Proceedings of the 2021 ACM Conference on Fairness, Accountability, and Transparency (FAccT '21)*.



## ML is Built on Finding and Enforcing Similarity

• Training "data" loses predictive **influence** on test with more privacy.



Patient

• Some patients lose more influence than others.

Black Test Patients				
Privacy Level	Average White Influence	Average Black Influence	Most Helpful Ethnicity	Most Harmful Ethnicity
None	$0.48 \pm 1.39$	$0.44 \pm 2.19$	Black	WHITE
Low	$-0.23\pm0.75$	$-0.03\pm0.18$	WHITE	WHITE
Нісн	$-0.40\pm4.10$	$0.12 \pm 1.45$	WHITE	WHITE

# Adding **privacy changes** the most **helpful group training data** from Black patients to White patients for **Black test patients**.

[1] Suriyakumar, Papernot, Goldenberg, Ghassemi. "Chasing Your Long Tails: Differentially Private Prediction in Health Care Settings." In *Proceedings of the 2021 ACM Conference on Fairness, Accountability, and Transparency (FAccT '21)*.





#### Finding and Enforcing Similarity

 Machine Learning is built on finding patterns in data, extending them, and removing outliers.









15

#### Finding and Enforcing Similarity

• Machine Learning is built on finding **patterns** in data, extending them, and removing **outliers**.



• What does it mean if a **human** is an "**outlier**"?



Bansal, Ankan, et al. "Zero-shot object detection." Proceedings of the European Conference on Computer Vision (ECCV). 2018.





#### Healthy Machine Learning in Health



#### Creating actionable insights in human health.





#### Bias Is Part of the Clinical Landscape

• How does/should ML interact with fairness/health<sup>1,2,3,4,5</sup>?

This Issue     Views 12,435     Citations 41     Altmetric 174       Viewpoint       August 11, 2015	<u>J Palliat Med</u> . 2013 Nov; 16(11): 1329–1334. doi: <u>10.1089/jpm.2013.9468</u>	PMCID: PMC3822363 PMID: <u>24073685</u>
August 11, 2015 Racial Bias in Health Care and Health Challenges and Opportunities David R. Williams, PhD, MPH <sup>1,2</sup> ; Ronald Wyatt, MD, MHA <sup>3</sup> Author Affiliations JAMA. 2015;314(6):555-556. doi:10.1001/jama.2015.9260	Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Palliative Care         Kimberly S. Johnson, MD, MHS <sup>⊠1,2</sup> Author information ► Article notes ► Copyright and License information ► Disclaimer         This article has been cited by other articles in PMC.	
② The Girl Who Cried Pain: A Bias Against Women in the Treatment of Pain Diane E. Hoffmann and Anita J. Tarzian	Am J Public Health. 2007 February; 97(2): 247–251. doi: 10.2105/AJPH.2005.072975 The Black–White Disparity in Pregnancy-Related Morta Differences in Prevalence and Case-Fatality Rates Myra J. Tucker, BSN, MPH, Cynthia J. Berg, MD, MPH, William M. Callaghan, MD, M Author information ► Article notes ► Copyright and License information ► Disclaimer	PMCID: PMC1781382 PMID: <u>17194867</u> I <b>ity From 5 Conditions:</b> IPH, and <u>Jason Hsia</u> , PhD

Obes Rev. 2015 Apr;16(4):319-26. doi: 10.1111/obr.12266. Epub 2015 Mar 5.

Impact of weight bias and stigma on quality of care and outcomes for patients with obesity.

Phelan SM<sup>1</sup>, Burgess DJ, Yeazel MW, Hellerstedt WL, Griffin JM, van Ryn M.

Author information

[1] Continuous State-Space Models for Optimal Sepsis Treatment - Deep Reinforcement Learning ... (MLHC/JMLR 2017);

[2] Modeling Mistrust in End-of-Life Care (MLHC 2018/FATML 2018 Workshop);

[3] The Disparate Impacts of Medical and Mental Health with AI. (AMA Journal of Ethics 2019);

[4] ClinicalVis Project with Google Brain. (\*In submission);





A) Overall Population

ime



Take 3 large **chest x-ray** datasets (707,626 images).  ${\color{black}\bullet}$ 







INE

- Take 3 large **chest x-ray** datasets (707,626 images).  $\bullet$
- Train a DenseNet to predict a "No Finding" label, e.g., model says patient is healthy.







- Take 3 large **chest x-ray** datasets (707,626 images).
- Train a DenseNet to predict a "No Finding" label, e.g., model says patient is healthy.
- Compare false positive rate (FPR) in different subpopulations to examine model underdiagnosis rates.

IME





Higher model underdiagnosis rates on one **subpopulation**, such as **female patients**, would lead to a **higher rate** of **no treatment** for those patients if the model were **deployed**.



[1] Seyyed-Kalantari, Zhang, Liu, McDermott, Chen, Ghassemi. "Medical imaging algorithms exacerbate biases in underdiagnosis." Nature Medicine 2021. To appear. 22





Largest underdiagnosis rates in Female







Largest underdiagnosis rates in Female, 0-20



[1] Seyyed-Kalantari, Zhang, Liu, McDermott, Chen, Ghassemi. "Medical imaging algorithms exacerbate biases in underdiagnosis." Nature Medicine 2021. To appear. 24





• Largest underdiagnosis rates in Female, 0-20, Black







Largest underdiagnosis rates in Female, 0-20, Black, and Medicaid insurance patients.

[1] Seyyed-Kalantari, Zhang, Liu, McDermott, Chen, Ghassemi. "Medical imaging algorithms exacerbate biases in underdiagnosis." Nature Medicine 2021. To appear. 26

ines





**Intersectional** identities are often underdiagnosed even more heavily than the aggregate group, e.g., **Black or Hispanic female patients** are underdiagnosed more than White female patients.

[1] Seyyed-Kalantari, Zhang, Liu, McDermott, Chen, Ghassemi. "Medical imaging algorithms exacerbate biases in underdiagnosis." Nature Medicine 2021. To appear. 27

ines





#### Auditing Fairness In Predictive Models

• Significant differences in model accuracy for race, sex, and insurance type in **ICU notes** and insurance type in **psychiatric notes**.



[1] Chen, Szolovits, Ghassemi. "Can Al Help Reduce Disparities in General Medical and Mental Health Care?." AMA journal of ethics 21.2 (2019): 167-179.



#### Hurtful Words: Quantifying Biases in Clinical Contextual Word Embeddings

Prompt: [\*\*RACE\*\*] pt became belligerent and violent .
 sent to [\*\*TOKEN\*\*] [\*\*TOKEN\*\*]

[1] Zhang, Lu, Abdallah, Ghassemi. "Hurtful Words: Quantifying Biases in Clinical Contextual Word Embeddings". ACM CHIL 2020.







#### Hurtful Words: Quantifying Biases in Clinical Contextual Word Embeddings

Prompt:	[**RACE**] pt became belligerent and violent . sent to [**TOKEN**] [**TOKEN**]
SciBERT:	<pre>caucasian pt became belligerent and violent . sent to hospital . white pt became belligerent and violent . sent to hospital .</pre>

[1] Zhang, Lu, Abdallah, Ghassemi. "Hurtful Words: Quantifying Biases in Clinical Contextual Word Embeddings". ACM CHIL 2020.

ime



#### Hurtful Words: Quantifying Biases in Clinical Contextual Word Embeddings

Prompt:	[**RACE**] pt became belligerent and violent . sent to [**TOKEN**] [**TOKEN**]
SciBERT:	<pre>caucasian pt became belligerent and violent . sent to hospital . white pt became belligerent and violent . sent to hospital . african pt became belligerent and violent . sent to prison . african american pt became belligerent and violent . sent to prison . black pt became belligerent and violent . sent to prison .</pre>

[1] Zhang, Lu, Abdallah, Ghassemi. "Hurtful Words: Quantifying Biases in Clinical Contextual Word Embeddings". ACM CHIL 2020.

ime





#### Complex Health Generates Complex Data



#### Healthy Machine Learning in Health



#### Creating actionable insights in human health.





#### How Much Behavioral Variation Could There Be?

- eBay auction study looked at iPods where researchers randomly varied the skin color on the hand holding the iPod.
- A white hand holding the iPod received 21 percent more offers than a black hand.







im

#### Diagnostic X-Ray Advice In Expert/Non-Experts

• What is clinical interaction with "AI" vs. "human" advice?



• Evaluate expert (radiologists) vs. non-expert (internal/emergency medicine) clinicians.

Gaube, Susanne, et al. "Do as AI say: susceptibility in deployment of clinical decision-aids." NPJ digital medicine 4.1 (2021): 1-8.

 $\mathbf{m}$ 



#### Expertise and Algorithmic Aversion

- Task-expert radiologists rate "AI" advice lower than "human" advice.
- Physicians across expertise levels failed to dismiss incorrect advice.



Gaube, Susanne, et al. "Do as AI say: susceptibility in deployment of clinical decision-aids." NPJ digital medicine 4.1 (2021): 1-8.

 $\mathbf{m}$ 



#### Expertise and Susceptibility

• Experts have better diagnostic accuracy; ~½ get ½ cases correct.





Gaube, Susanne, et al. "Do as AI say: susceptibility in deployment of clinical decision-aids." NPJ digital medicine 4.1 (2021): 1-8.



#### Expertise and Susceptibility

- Experts have better diagnostic accuracy; ~½ get ½ cases correct.
- Some doctors are more **susceptible to incorrect advice** than others.





Gaube, Susanne, et al. "Do as AI say: susceptibility in deployment of clinical decision-aids." NPJ digital medicine 4.1 (2021): 1-8.



#### No Simple Fixes for Ethical ML in Health



- This is an **on-going** process that requires improvement.
- Requires engagement on many levels by diverse teams.

Chen, Irene Y., et al. "Ethical Machine Learning in Healthcare." Annual Review of Biomedical Data Science 4 (2020).



#### No Simple Fixes for Ethical ML in Health



- This is an **on-going** process that requires improvement.
- Requires engagement on many levels by diverse teams.

Chen, Irene Y., et al. "Ethical Machine Learning in Healthcare." Annual Review of Biomedical Data Science 4 (2020).





#### Availability of Embodied Data

- All data is valuable; embodied health data particularly so.
- Robust, private, fair, high-quality algorithms require large-scale diverse datasets for research use.



Improving Patient Care with Machine Learning At Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center

by Dr. Matt Wood | on 04 MAR 2019 | Permalink | 🗩 Comments | 🏞 Share

Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center has launched a multi-year, innovative research program on how machine learning can improve patient care, supported by an academic research sponsorship grant from AWS. The Harvard Medical School-affiliated teaching hospital will use a broad array of AWS machine learning services to uncover new ways that machine learning technology can enhance clinical care, streamline operations, and eliminate waste, with the goal of improving patient care and quality of life.

Improving patient care with machine learning

Inefficiencies in hospital management and operations are not only extremely costly to providers, insurers, patients, and taxpayers, but they can result in precious resources being diverted away from patient care. These inefficiencies drive healthcare costs up and can contribute to life-threatening medical

#### **Amazon Comprehend Medical**

Extract information from unstructured medical text accurately and quickly No machine learning experience required

Get started with Amazon Comprehend Medica

Amazon Comprehend Medical is a natural language processing service that makes it easy to use machine learning to extract relevant medical information from unstructured text. Using Amazon Comprehend Medical, you can quickly and accurately gather information, such as medical condition, medication, dosage, strength, and frequency from a variety of sources like doctors' notes, clinical trial reports, and patient health records.



41

#### Google Tries to Patent Healthcare Deep Learning, EHR Analytics

Google has applied for a sweeping patent including the fundamentals of deep learning and EHR analytics in the healthcare industry.



Source: Google

#### Health Lags Other ML Subfields in Reproducibility



- ML in Health lags in reproducibility metrics:
  - Releasing code (A1)
  - Releasing data (A2)
  - Leveraging multiple data-sets (C1)



McDermott, Matthew BA, et al. "Reproducibility in machine learning for health research: Still a ways to go." Science Translational Medicine 13.586 (2021).





#### Synthetic Data Is Not a Robust Solution

- Biased datasets can have disparate impacts on minority downstream classification influence...
  - Even when the <u>real dataset</u> is <u>not directly used</u>
  - Even when the <u>synthetic dataset</u> used for the training <u>is balanced</u>



 Supplementing or replacing datasets with synthetic data does not mitigate the fairness concerns caused by the existing biases in imbalanced datasets.

Cheng, Victoria, et al. "Can You Fake It Until You Make It? Impacts of Differentially Private Synthetic Data on Downstream Classification Fairness." *Proceedings of the 2021 ACM Conference on Fairness, Accountability, and Transparency*. 2021.



#### Neither Is Post-Hoc Balancing

- Bias in data causes asymmetric upstream embeddings.
- Biased embeddings **impact** downstream tasks, even with **rebalancing**!





#### The Tip of The AI-ceberg

• Some issues lie very far under the waterline, and require introspection.



Chen, Irene Y., et al. "Ethical Machine Learning in Healthcare." Annual Review of Biomedical Data Science 4 (2020).





# Healthy ML @ MIT IMES **EECS.CSAIL**

#### Students



Natalie

Dullerud





Aparna Zhang Balagopalan Hamideh



Gowda



Zhang



Killian





Nathan Ng

Bret Nestor

#### Collaborators (Technical and Clinical)



Suriyakumar







Fahad



Mamdani



Leo Celi

#### Mehdi Anna Goldenburg Fatemi

Shalmali Joshi



Verma

Razak

#### Funding Sources

- CIFAR AI Chair & CIFAR Azrieli Global Scholar
- Microsoft Research
- Helmsley Trust
- Wellcome Trust
- Quanta Computing







#### Healthy Machine Learning in Health



#### Creating actionable insights in human health.



